

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR
THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
NORFOLK DIVISION**

Latasha Holloway, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

City of Virginia Beach, *et al.*,

Defendants

Civil Action No. 2:18-cv-0069

**PLAINTIFFS' BRIEF IN OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR
SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 3

Dr. Allan Lichtman's Supplemental Table R3-A and Chart R3-A

TABLE R3-A, NEW AFRICAN AMERICAN CITY COUNCIL CANDIDATES IN VIRGINIA BEACH, 2008 TO 2018, REVISION OF KIDD TABLES 1 AND 2, CANDIDATES OF CHOICE OF MINORITY VOTERS			
Black Candidates of Choice of Minority Voters, Would Have Won With Minority Votes Only	Actual Outcome	Not Candidate of Choice of Minority Voters	Outcome
Wooten 2018	Won	Wray 2018	Lost
Rouse 2018	Won	Bright 2018	Lost
Ross-Hammond 2016	Lost	Furman 2016	Lost
Cabiness 2014	Lost	Burton 2014	Lost
Ross-Hammond 2012	Won	Furman 2014	Lost
Sherrod 2011	Lost	Smith 2012	Lost
Jackson 2010	Lost	Cabiness 2010	Lost
Bullock 2010	Lost	Furman 2010	Lost
Allen 2008	Lost	Flores 2008	Lost
Jackson 2008	Lost		
All assessments of minority candidate of choice are confirmed by both Ecological Regression and Ecological Inference estimates provided by Dr. Spencer.			

CHART R3-A: VICTORIES AND DEFEATS FOR BLACK CITY COUNCIL CANDIDATES OF CHOICE OF MINORITY VOTERS, VIRGINIA BEACH, 2008-2018

